

Health Expenditure, Democracy and Child Mortality in Developing Countries

Mongbet Zounkifirou, Nkoa Francois, Mongbet Ousseni, Njournemi Zakariaou*

Department of Economics and Management/University of Yaoundé II, Yaoundé, Cameroon.

*Corresponding author: Njournemi Zakariaou, Department of Economics and Management/University of Yaoundé II, Yaoundé, Cameroon, E-mail: mongbetzounkifirou@yahoo.fr

Citation: Zounkifirou M, Francois N, Ousseni M, Zakariaou N (2021) Health Expenditure, Democracy and Child Mortality in Developing Countries. Journal of Health & Medical Economics Vol.7 No.2:1.

Received date: February 02, 2021; Accepted date: February 16, 2021; Published date: February 23, 2021

Abstract

The main objective of this study is to assess the impact of health expenditure on child mortality in the developing countries with due consideration for democracy. To achieve this, we use the two-stage dynamic panel generalized method of moments. Our sample covers 126 countries over the period 1995-2017. Our main results show that sub-Saharan Africa is the only sub-region where health expenditure is negatively and significantly associated with child mortality. However, when we take into account the ranking of countries by income level, we find that health expenditure has a positive and significant effect on child mortality only in the least developed, low income, and lower-middle-income countries. On the other hand, it is in the countries of Eurasia, North Africa, and Latin America that a significant reduction in the child mortality rate takes place in the presence of democratic institutions; to this must be added the upper-middle-income countries. For example, respect for civil liberties, control of government by a democratically elected parliament, combined with spending on health care, contribute to a significant decrease in child mortality. The results of this study are an important issue for policymakers, providing them with a kind of theoretical and empirical argument presenting health expenditure as a major determinant in public health policy. Thus, in their fight against child mortality, it is in the interest of governments in developing countries to improve not only the quality of their health spending but also, and above all, their institutional framework, especially democratic governance.

Keywords: Health expenditure; Democracy; Child mortality; Developing countries

Introduction

The importance of the child mortality rate as an indicator of human health and development was first recognized and highlighted on the international agenda in the early 2000s, with its inclusion in the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), which had a target date of 2015. For example, global under-five mortality was to be reduced from 93 deaths per 1,000 live births in 1990 to 31 in 2015, but the targets differed considerably within and across countries. Indeed, child mortality is associated with various factors such as maternal health, quality and access

to medical care, socioeconomic conditions, and public health practices and its reduction is nowadays considered as the ultimate goal of governments in public health policy. It is in this context that efforts to reduce it have received a new impetus after 2015, with the inclusion of the goal of ensuring better health and well-being for all in the 2030 agenda of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), with an absolute level of 25 deaths per 1,000 live births as the main target (UN-IGME). Despite considerable progress in reducing child mortality, the MDGs have not been met by almost all regions, except for East and South-East Asia, where it has fallen from 55 to 18 deaths per 1,000 live births. In Europe and North America, where the under-five mortality rate was at a low level in 1990, the under-five mortality rate more than halved between 1990 and 2015[1-5].

Indeed, the global child mortality rate has fallen from 146 deaths per 1,000 live births in 1950 to 28 deaths per 1,000 live births in 2019, a reduction of 80%. The largest reduction occurred in North Africa and Western Asia, where the rate fell from 313 deaths per 1,000 live births in 1950 to 26 in 2019, a reduction of more than 90%. Central and South Asia and sub-Saharan Africa also recorded large reductions in absolute terms, with rates declining by more than 200 deaths per 1,000 live birth points. In contrast, under-five mortality is highest in sub-Saharan Africa, with a rate of 74 deaths per 1,000 live births. This means that a child born in sub-Saharan Africa in 2019 is about 20 times more likely to die before the age of five than a child born in Australia and New Zealand.

The importance of health in factor accumulation is recognized in most endogenous growth models. Indeed, enriched human capital is considered an important factor in achieving the desired economic growth and development in any country. According to the neoclassical growth model, the growth of human capital, in terms of education and health, has a positive effect on per capita income in the long run. Based on the undeniable role of population health and its contribution to the national economy, researchers have been conducting studies for more than two decades to explore how it can be improved. Hitiris and Posnett (1992) and Feldstein (1988) were responsible for the first theoretical studies on national income and the accounting of national health expenditures. Numerous studies have sought to analyze the impact of health expenditure on health outcomes; however, the results are inconclusive or even contradictory.

The findings from these studies can be classified into three groups: On the one hand, those that present health expenditure as the main determinant of declining child mortality. These findings corroborate existing theoretical and empirical studies. Child health outcomes have also been found to be positively and statistically significantly related to delays in health expenditures. For example, Rhee (2012) conducted a country-specific analysis of the effects of health expenditures on infant mortality rate and life expectancy at birth in Korea and found that there is a significant and positive relationship between health care spending and both measures of health outcomes. Bokhari et al. (2007) estimated the relationship between health expenditure, per capita income, and health outcomes using under-five mortality and maternal mortality as health outcome measures. The results suggest, however, that economic growth contributes more to health outcomes than public spending on health for developing countries. On the other hand, some studies find little or no significant relationship between the two variables, based on an empirical study, demonstrated that public health expenditures are not a factor in reducing infant mortality. They estimate that variables such as income, income inequality, women's education, and the degree of ethnolinguistic fragmentation explain almost all variations in child mortality in a country.

Finally, the literature notes the third category of studies based on the idea that the effectiveness of health expenditures in reducing child mortality depends on a combination of factors. found that the mortality rate depends simultaneously on health expenditures and the choice of a health insurance system. In particular, an increase in the share of public funding devoted to health care spending is accompanied by an increase in mortality rates. have shown that public spending on health plays a more important role for the poor in low-income countries than in high-income countries, indicating that the return on health spending was higher in high-income countries. showed that access to health infrastructure significantly reduces child mortality and that socioeconomic factors are the main determinants of child health status.

However, controversies over the conclusions may be due to several factors: country-specific characteristics (quality of institutions and governance, geography and social and historical facts, and many others), the nature of the instruments used, and the time horizon of the studies. Focusing exclusively on factors related to the quality of governance, the literature reveals that the institutional environment plays an undeniable role in the analysis of the impact of health expenditure on child mortality. have provided a fairly powerful analysis of the role of governance in improving child health outcomes. Examining differences in the results of work on public health expenditure in the presence of different levels of governance quality, they find that good governance improves the impact of public expenditure on child mortality[6].

Good governance is important in the delivery of health care, and returns on health investments are low when governance issues are not addressed. Governance affects health through two main channels. Its indirect effect on national income, (corruption reduces economic growth) and thus on household

income and health determinants and directly on the health care sector. In more developed countries, governance has a positive effect on health through the health care sector, while in less developed countries, good governance affects health mainly through its indirect impact on income, and i.e. the income channel predominates[7]. Governance not only has an independent influence on health outcomes. However, it also mediates the impact of public health on health outcomes. As a result, the allocation of funds to the health sector under poor governance may be insufficient to improve health outcomes. Indeed, poor intra-sectoral allocation, poor targeting, and inefficient delivery are among the reasons for the negligible impact of public health on health tests the impact of public health expenditure on child health taking into account institutional quality. His main findings show that health expenditure has a positive and significant effect on child mortality only for high-income countries, whereas for low-, lower-middle- and upper-middle-income countries, health expenditure has no significant impact on child health status[8].

Despite this wealth of work, very few have assessed the contribution of health spending to reducing child mortality in democratic environments. Other authors have pointed out that the conclusions of many of these studies overlook the potential existence of lagged effects arising from the relationship between health spending and child mortality. Furthermore, it will be interesting to empirically test the nature of this relationship by taking into account the lagged effect of health expenditures. Building on the work of, it will be important for us to determine the threshold level of public spending on health that is consistent with declining child mortality. The contribution of our research effort is threefold. First, to assess the impact of health spending on child mortality in developing countries, taking into account their degree of democratization. Second, to capture and analyze the delayed effect of health spending on child mortality. Finally, determine the minimum threshold of health expenditure (as share of GDP) compatible with the reduction of child mortality[9].

Methodology and data

The main objective of this research effort is to assess the impact of health expenditure on child mortality, as measured by under-five child mortality rates (U5Mort) in developing countries, taking into account the degree of democratization and using annual data for the period 1995-2017. To do so, we specify a model to capture the direct and indirect effects of health expenditures. Thus, the model proposed in this study is based on the work of which explains the IMR by public health expenditure and a set of control variables generally used in this type of work. It is a dynamic two stage GMM model that seems more appropriate in that it can simultaneously test the effects of health expenditure on infant mortality directly via medical needs and indirectly via the degree of democratization. The specification of the model is consistent with the literature and allows the identification of channels through which total health expenditure and other variables affect the health of children under 5 years[10].

Data sources

It should be recalled that the objective of this research effort is to evaluate the impact of health expenditure on child mortality, taking into account democracy in developing countries. According to the latest OECD Development Assistance Committee (DAC) ranking, developing countries are classified into four categories: Least Developed Countries (LDCs), the majority of which are sub-Saharan African countries. Low-Income Countries (LICs), Lower Middle-Income Countries (Lower Middle-Income Countries), and Upper Middle-Income Countries (Upper Middle-Income Countries) by using the method of moments generalized in the Panel. The choice of this technique is to prevent endogeneity biases that can occur in econometric regressions. To confirm the validity of the instruments used, we carry out the Sargan test; this test is based on the null hypothesis that there is no autocorrelation between the residuals and the instruments used. Our sample covers 126 countries over the period 1995-2017. The data for this study come from the World Development Indicator database. Table 1 below presents descriptive statistics for the different variables used.

Results and discussion

The second period commenced immediately after the first on December 20, 2018 and ended on April 30, 2019, for a duration of 132 days. The trout from each treatment (control or enriched) were pooled on December 19, 2018 and then placed back into three tanks per group ($n=3$). Fish remained in the same treatment for both periods. To maintain approximately the same number of fish per tank (2,500) at the start of the second period, the unenriched and enriched tanks received 6.4 kg and 6.7 kg of fish per tank, respectively. The tanks containing the enriched fish received a small increase in the amount of food compared to the control tanks because of the slightly heavier initial loading. Fish were fed 1.5 mm pellets (Protec, Skretting USA, Tooele, Utah, USA). Feeding rates were identical to the first period, as was data collection at the end of the period.

The results of the econometric estimates using the two-step GMM method are reported in Table 2. Thus we have retained as variables of interest: the under-five mortality rate, and as variables of interest health expenditure and democracy; as control variables, we have the female primary school enrolment rate and immunization coverage. Immunization against diphtheria, tetanus, and polio. Thus, we had to run four different regressions of our model to obtain a clear description of the results obtained. The results in the first column of the table are obtained without the introduction of the health expenditure variable. The idea is to be able to capture the impact of the control variables such as the GDP/capita, DPT immunization, and social globalization. Column 2 is obtained by adding our variable of interest which is health expenditure. Column 3 includes, in addition to the variables mentioned above, the democratic indices. The fourth and last column groups together not only the above variables but also and above all those relating to the analysis of the correlation between health expenditure and democracy and the variable $\text{HealtExpe}^*\text{Democracy}$. The results

on the validity of the instruments used on different regression models are confirmed. This can be observed via the calculated values of the probabilities of the sargan test. The results of the estimates of the different models (columns 1 to 4) show that the coefficients associated with the health expenditure variables and the lagged value of the infant mortality rate are significant and are otherwise of the expected sign. This suggests, on the one hand, that health expenditure is essential in public policies to combat child mortality in developing countries. On the other hand, we can confirm that the current level of under-five mortality is a function of its previous level, this is consistent with the results of Dhrif (2018) who found that the initial level of the infant mortality rate (IMR) has a positive sign and is statistically highly significant, suggesting that the previous level of infant mortality rate is relevant to explain the current level of child deaths.

Indeed, the results show that there is a negative and significant relationship at the 1% significance threshold between health expenditure and the infant mortality rate. The estimated value of the expenditure coefficient suggests that a 10% increase in health expenditure translates into a 1.83% decrease in the level of infant mortality. This is consistent with the assumption that health expenditure is an important instrument in the fight against child mortality. These results confirm those of Novignon and Lawanson (2017). This means that it is in the interest of developing countries to invest substantially in their health systems to achieve a global result on the health of populations in general and that of children in particular. While many developing countries face unprecedented constraints on resource levels, it has been suggested that additional revenues could still be generated if resources are well managed.

Furthermore, variables such as GDP per capita, social globalization are all statistically significant at 1% and negatively correlated with the infant mortality rate. Our results show that a 10% increase in the level of GDP per capita is associated with a 12.23% decrease in the child mortality rate. An improvement in the GDP growth rate in developing countries could, however, solve the problems of food insecurity, precarious buildings, and equipment, lack of adequate social infrastructure, and insufficient budget to reduce child and maternal mortality. Besides, higher incomes lead to improved public health infrastructure such as water and sanitation, better nutrition, better housing, and the ability to pay for health care. In terms of globalization, we note that a 1% increase in the level of social globalization reduces infant mortality by 0.1%; this to a significant 1%. Social globalization, understood here as the interconnection between the citizens of the world has become an important determinant in the fight against scourges, social, and health crises. Indeed, a high level of national and international migration is an important contextual element that significantly affects the health status of children in developing countries.

Democracy and child mortality

Now, we examine the relationship between health spending and child mortality with a focus on democracy. The estimated coefficients of the third model are of expected sign (see the last

column). Democracy contributes significantly to the reduction of under-five mortality in developing countries. Thus, a 10% increase in the level of democracy is associated with a 0.002% decrease in the child mortality rate. That said, in democratic countries, child mortality is a major policy concern. Even if this coefficient seems low, it should be noted that it is significant at 1% of the significance threshold. However, when we make the variable democracy interact with health spending, the signs and value of the elasticity of democracy remain unchanged but become insignificant. However, we observe that the DemoHealth variable combining democracy and health expenditure reduces child mortality but not significantly.

Overall, our results show that health spending is an important determinant of child mortality reduction in developing countries, and this evidence is much stronger when the institutional and, above all, the democratic framework is improved, especially when there is oversight of executive action by a democratically elected parliament. However, these results conceal a certain weakness, given that they are obtained on the assumption that all the countries in the sample have the same characteristics, which is not the case in reality. Recall that our sample covers 126 developing countries, each with its economic structure and effects, i.e. all of them are heterogeneous. In this case, it is difficult to generalize our results to all the individuals in our sample. To this end, it is necessary to check whether our results could withstand certain tests. For this purpose, we perform two robustness checks.

This first test consists of making a regional distribution of our sample; this is done by dividing it into three sub-samples: the Eurasian countries of North Africa and the Middle East; the countries of sub-Saharan Africa and finally the countries of Latin America and the Caribbean. We use the same estimation strategies and time horizon (1995-2017). The results of the test are contained in Table 3 below. It appears that the impact of health expenditure on child mortality varies considerably from one sub-region to another. In particular, we observe that only sub-Saharan Africa is the region where health expenditure has a negative and significant effect on children's health, while the effects appear to be statistically insignificant for the countries of the Middle East and Eurasia and Latin America and the Caribbean. This result is consistent with other studies that have found no significant relationship between the two variables and. These results show that expenditure cannot be considered in all places as a major determinant of child mortality reduction.

The second part of our test consists of dividing our sample into three groups based on the different income brackets according to the 2016 OECD Development Assistance Committee (DAC) country classification approach. The DAC classifies countries into four categories according to their level of per capita income. These are the Least Developed Countries (LDCs) and Low-income Countries (LICs) whose Gross National Income per capita is less than or equal to \$1005. Lower-middle income countries (LIMICs) with a per capita GNI of \$1,006-\$3,955. Finally, Upper Middle-Income Countries (Upper middle Income Countries (UMI_{sup}) with Upper (GNI per capita \$3,956 -\$12,235 in 2016).

These results show that it is only in the least developed, low- and lower middle-income countries that health expenditure has a positive and significant effect on child mortality, whereas, for upper-middle-income countries, such expenditure does not have a significant impact on child mortality. A 10% increase in health expenditure in the least developed countries is accompanied by a 3.3 percentage point decrease in the child mortality rate. This result is also strongly confirmed in Table 4. This result confirms the point we made earlier, namely that the level of per capita income is a determining factor in reducing child mortality in developing countries. Thus, for all three groups of countries classified according to income, GDP per capita appears to be significantly and negatively correlated with the child mortality rate.

About the degree of democratization, it emerges that only the least developed countries are likely to benefit from a premium on improved child mortality as a result of respect for some principle of democracy. For example, respect for civil liberties and parliamentary oversight of the government could contribute to a significant reduction in child mortality. Curiously, democracy rather contributes to increasing child mortality rates in upper-middle-income countries. Thus, in this income category, a 10% increase in the level of democracy is associated with a 0.4% increase in the under-five mortality rate at the 1% significance level. On the other hand, the opposite result is obtained when we analyze the impact of the interaction of democracy with health expenditures on child mortality. To this effect, a 10% increase in the level of interaction between health expenditure and the level of democracy is associated with a 0.2% drop in the infant mortality rate at the 1% threshold. Overall, it appears that it is in the interest of developing countries to improve their macroeconomic situation and their institutional environment to effectively and sustainably reduce their child mortality rate.

Conclusion and policy implications

The objective of this research effort is to assess the impact of health expenditure on child mortality with consideration of democratic quality in the context of developing countries over the period 1995-2017 using the method of generalized moments in Panel. The choice of this technique is to prevent endogeneity biases that can occur in econometric regressions. To confirm the validity of the instruments used, we carry out the Sargan test. This test is based on the null hypothesis that there is no correlation between the residuals and the instruments used. The results show that there is a negative and significant relationship between health expenditures and the infant mortality rate. This is consistent with the hypothesis that health expenditure is a major determinant in the fight against child mortality. However, the results of the robustness tests show that it is only in the least developed, low- and lower middle-income countries that health expenditure has a negative and significant effect on child mortality, whereas, for lower-middle-income countries, health expenditure does not have a significant impact on child mortality. Concerning the degree of democratization, it appears that only countries in Eurasia, North Africa, and Latin America achieve significant reductions in child mortality rates in the presence of democratic institutions; to this must be added upper-middle-income countries. For example, respect for civil

liberties and parliamentary oversight of government contribute to a significant decrease in child mortality.

In general, our results show that health spending is an important determinant of child mortality reduction in developing countries, and these results are even stronger when the institutional and democratic framework is improved, especially when there is oversight of the executive branch of government by a democratically elected parliament. The results of this study are an important issue for policy-makers, providing them with a kind of theoretical and empirical argument for the use of health spending. Thus, in their fight against child mortality, it is in their interest to improve the quality of health expenditure and, above all, their institutional framework. A better allocation of resources for the health sector in developing countries could, however, solve the problems of food insecurity, precarious buildings, and equipment, lack of adequate social infrastructure, and insufficient budget to reduce child and maternal mortality.

Conclusion

The results of this study support the use of vertically suspended structure as environmental enrichment to improve the hatchery rearing performance of juvenile rainbow trout. However, it may not be needed during the period of initial feeding. Additional research using larger sample sizes and different fish species should be conducted on environmental enrichment during initial feeding or shortly there-after.

References

1. Arellano M, Bond S (1991) Some test of specification for panel data: Monte Carlo evidence and an application to employment equation. *Review of Economic Studies* 58: 2777–2997
2. Arrelano M, Bover, O (1995) Another look at the instrumental variables estimation of error components models. *Journal of Econometrics. Aquac* 68: 29-51.
3. Baldacci E, Hillman AL, Kojo, NC. (2004) Growth, governance, and fiscal policy transmission channels in low-income countries. *European Journal of Political Economy*. 20(3): 517–549
4. Berger MC, Messer J (2005) Public financing of health expenditures, insurance, and health outcomes. *Applied* 34(17): 2105–2114
5. Berthelemy JC, Seban J (2009) Dépenses de santé et équité dans l'accès aux services de santé dans les pays en développement. *d'Économie du Développement*. 23(1), 33–71.
6. Parker TM, Barnes ME (2015) Effects of different water velocities on the hatchery rearing performance and recovery from transportation of rainbow trout fed two different rations. *Transactions Am Fisheries Society* 144: 882-890
7. Hyvärinen P, Rodewald P (2013) Enriched rearing improves survival of hatchery-reared Atlantic salmon smolts during migration in the River Tornionjoki. *Canadian J Fisheries and Aquatic Sci* 70: 1386-1395
8. Roberts LJ, Taylor J, Gough PJ, Forman DW, Leaniz CGD (2014) Silver spoons in the rough: can environmental enrichment improve survival of hatchery Atlantic salmon *Salmo salar* in the wild? *J Fish Bio* 85: 1972-1991
9. Zydlewski GB, Foott JS, Nichols K, Hamelberg S, Zydlewski J et al. (2003) Enhanced smolt characteristics of steelhead trout exposed to alternative hatchery conditions during the final months of rearing. *Aquacult* 222: 101-117.
10. Lee JSF, Berejikian BA (2008) Effects of the rearing environment on average behaviour and behavioural variation in steelhead. *J of Fish Bio* 72: 1736-1749